| **Student Name:** James Gao |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  **Repeat comment: we need to have strong openings. We’ve talked about this before, but if we keep repeating the motion, or even jumping straight to set-up, what is our opening doing for impact on the judge?**  Set-up   * We need to characterise what the interests of this actor are. Who are they, what constraints are they in and so forth?   Argument 1   * Thesis? What will we prove here? * Don’t take a POI in the middle of a sentence! You still have to answer the question! * A large chunk of this analysis should be in your set-up instead! Your argument should explain why going to a university is a bad choice because of the financial cost it comes at the cost of! * Good on primary and secondary education being free, and how tertiary education is expensive. Good on how loans are not a possibility. * Good on lack of resources with regards to scholarship applications.   Argument 2   * Thesis? What will you prove here? * On studying whilst they are working - is this motion specific or directly relevant?   03:00 - we need to be able to hit four!  Good POI to Jenny! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jenny Zong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 67 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  What is this opening? Prop explained how financial cost is pretty significant, and prevents this dream from being realised, and we just dismiss this? You need to explain why there are ways to access university, and why university is worth going to.  What is the structure of this speech? Where is the signposting? Where is counter set-up?  ‘Servant’? Be mindful of your language, you mean a ‘server’ or a ‘waiter’.  Why will the pressure be so significant such that this is impossible; lots of students do this in status quo. Explain why and how this stress is so significant.  Argument 1 - Title? Thesis?   * You’re asserting that this is what university does, rather than explaining at all why this happens. * Why would they get stuck in the food or hospitality industry? * POI - they’re poor. You need to consider what the actor in the motion is, and how realistic the claims you are making are. * You need to reason out why what you are saying is true, rather than asking questions during your speech.   We need to ask POIs consistently.  03:50 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Renee Yang |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  What is this opening? Is this the most important response that you are putting this up front? Your actual first response on finances is correct, open with this instead. Punish them for the lack of realism in the case; they are not analysing who this actor is, what their circumstances are and so forth.  Rebuttal   * Explain why even a talented student is unlikely to get all the help needed. * Good on ability to go back to university. * Good on responsibility to other family members; why is this something the actor in the motion cares lots about? * Good on community college. * I think we want to clearly spell out how the most pressing issue for a poor family is often immediate financial stability. Working after graduation allows the student to contribute to the family income, alleviating financial burdens and potentially supporting younger siblings' education. This direct and immediate impact outweighs the long-term, uncertain benefits of a university degree.   Argument 1   * Thesis? * Fair on limited scholarships, but is this motion specific? You can argue how there are increasing non university options for students, such as online courses, apprenticeships and so on. * What is the value of a college degree in the status quo? Is this going to lead to the social mobility Opp hints at but never explains?   04:09 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jacky Xu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  You need to explain from the get go why university is feasible for these poor students. Renee tells me how this isn’t a possibility; to the extent this is true none of your outcomes can materialise. Resolve this up top.  Rebuttal   * Good mitigation on being able to double duty work and university. * We need to explain why the sacrifice or trade off is worth it. Emphasise that while working immediately might provide short-term financial relief, a university degree offers a path to long-term financial stability and a higher quality of life for both the individual and their family. Highlight the potential for a university degree to not only benefit the individual but also future generations, creating opportunities for their children and grandchildren. * Why is a university degree the mechanism of change? Is it that many higher-paying jobs and careers require specialised skills and knowledge that are typically acquired through university education? Is it the social network and capital you build at university?   We need to consider the role of the actor in the round, and whether or not we’re taking their constraints into serious consideration!  04:20 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Bernard Chong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is it a fairytale world? What is unrealistic about their case? You are being vague here and need to tell me what exactly you are talking about! It is that there is a serious financial hurdle that exists, and they’ve provided no clarity here. You respond to this after your opening, but need to make it the big thing you open with.  Why are we still doing extraneous rebuttals? Put everything into clashes please.  Good on banks and why they will not provide loans to students.  Why is a public university or government university not good enough? I think we want to clearly spell out how the most pressing issue for a poor family is often immediate financial stability. Working after graduation allows the student to contribute to the family income, alleviating financial burdens and potentially supporting younger siblings' education. This direct and immediate impact outweighs the long-term, uncertain benefits of a university degree.  Clash 1 - LT v ST   * Explain how ST matters more because survival of self and loved ones is contingent on this.   Clash 2 - Risk   * Is this different from Clash 1? * You can argue how there are increasing non university options for students, such as online courses, apprenticeships and so on. * What is the value of a college degree in the status quo? Does it really lead to mobility as they claim?   We need to ask POIs consistently.  03:51 | | | | | | |